Transitional Bilingual Education or Dual Language Immersion?

Navigating Program Selection and Implementation in Texas
Objectives

- Highlight differences in the four state-approved program models for bilingual education

- Explore research comparing the program models and statewide snapshot student outcomes

- Identify state-developed resources and tools to guide internal program evaluation and ensure fidelity of implementation
Bilingual Program Models
English Learner Program Models in Texas

**TEC 29.066; TAC 89.1210**

Districts must serve English learners (ELs) through BE or ESL

**Program Requirements TAC 89.1205**

- **44%** Bilingual Education (BE) Program Models
  - Transitional Early Exit: 18%
  - Transitional Late Exit: 5%
  - Dual Language Immersion One-Way: 15%
  - Dual Language Immersion Two-Way: 6%

- **52%** English as a Second Language (ESL) Program Models
  - ESL Content-Based: 28%
  - ESL Pull-Out: 24%

- **4%** English learners with parental denial of program services

TAPR 2018
**General Description**

A bilingual program model in which students identified as English learners are served in both English and another language and are prepared to meet reclassification criteria to be successful in English-only instruction not earlier than 2 or later than 5 years after the student enrolls in school.

**Certifications**

Instruction in this program is delivered by a teacher appropriately certified in bilingual education under TEC §29.061(b)(1) for the assigned grade level and content area.

**Goal**

The goal of early-exit transitional bilingual education is for program participants to utilize their primary language as a resource while acquiring full proficiency in English.

**Instructional Approach**

This model provides instruction in literacy and academic content through the medium of the students’ primary language, along with instruction in English that targets second language development through academic content.
Early Exit Transitional Bilingual Program Model

- **Spanish**
  - PK Literacy
  - K Literacy
  - 1st Literacy
  - Transition Year

- **English**
  - Oracy Focused (Listening & Speaking)
  - Grade Level Reading
  - English literacy instruction until reclassification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>PK</th>
<th>K</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PK</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1st</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transition Year</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
<td>PK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### General Description
A bilingual program model in which students identified as English learners are served in both English and another language and are prepared to meet reclassification criteria to be successful in English-only instruction not earlier than 6 or later than 7 years after the student enrolls in school.

### Certifications
Instruction in this program is delivered by a teacher appropriately certified in bilingual education under TEC, §29.061(b)(1) for the assigned grade level and content area.

### Goal
The goal of late-exit transitional bilingual education is for program participants to utilize their primary language as a resource while acquiring full proficiency in English.

### Instructional Approach
This model provides instruction in literacy and academic content through the medium of the students’ primary language, along with instruction in English that targets second language development through academic content.
Late Exit Transitional Bilingual Program Model

- Spanish
- English

Grade Level Literacy

Oracy Focused (Listening & Speaking)

Transition

English literacy instruction until reclassification

PK K 1 2 3 4 5 6
Transitional Model Comparison

Early Exit

- **Spanish**
  - PK Literacy
  - Oracy Focused (Listening & Speaking)
  - English Literacy

- **English**
  - PK Literacy
  - Oracy Focused (Listening & Speaking)
  - Grade Level Literacy

Late Exit

- **Spanish**
  - Grade Level Literacy
  - English literacy instruction until reclassification

- **English**
  - Oracy Focused (Listening & Speaking)
  - Grade Level Literacy
  - English literacy instruction until reclassification
**General Description**

A bilingual/biliteracy program model in which students identified as English learners are served in both English and another language and are prepared to meet reclassification criteria in order to be successful in English-only instruction not earlier than six or later than seven years after the student enrolls in school.

**Certifications**

Instruction provided in a language other than English in this program model is delivered by a teacher appropriately certified in bilingual education under TEC, §29.061. *Instruction provided in English in this program model may be delivered either by a teacher appropriately certified in bilingual education or by a different teacher certified in ESL in accordance with TEC §29.061.*

**Goal**

The goal of one-way dual language immersion is for program participants to attain **full proficiency** the partner language as well as English.

**Instructional Approach**

This model provides ongoing instruction in literacy and academic content in the students’ primary language as well as English, with at least half of the instruction delivered in the partner language for the duration of the program.
### General Description

A bilingual/biliteracy program model in which students identified as English learners are integrated with students proficient in English and are served in both English and another language and are prepared to meet reclassification criteria in order to be successful in English-only instruction not earlier than six or later than seven years after the student enrolls in school.

### Certifications

Instruction provided in a language other than English in this program model is delivered by a teacher appropriately certified in bilingual education under TEC, §29.061. *Instruction provided in English in this program model may be delivered either by a teacher appropriately certified in bilingual education or by a different teacher certified in ESL in accordance with TEC §29.061.*

### Goal

The goal of one-way dual language immersion is for program participants to attain full proficiency in another language as well as English.

### Instructional Approach

This model provides ongoing instruction in literacy and academic content in the students’ primary language as well as English, with at least half of the instruction delivered in the students’ primary language for the duration of the program.
80/20 Dual Language Immersion Model

345 Instructional Minutes Per Day

Grade | SLA | English | ELD | IB | Math | SS | Science |
--- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
PreK  | 275 |  | 70 |  |  |  |  |
Kinder | 110 | 40 | 30 | 90 | 30 | 45 | 45 |
1st   | 90  | 60 | 30 | 90 | 30 | 45 | 45 |
2nd   | 90  | 60 | 30 | 90 | 30 | 45 | 45 |
3rd   | 75  | 75 | 30 | 90 | 30 | 45 | 45 |
4th   | 75  | 75 | 30 | 90 | 30 | 45 | 45 |
5th   | 75  | 75 | 30 | 90 | 30 | 45 | 45 |

SLA = Spanish Language Arts
ELD = English Literacy Development
IB = Intervention Block
SS = Social Studies

San Antonio ISD, Oct 2018
### Departmentalization vs. Paired Teaching in DLI

#### Departmentalization
**Any DLI Language Allocation Model**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher A</th>
<th>Teacher B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual Cert</td>
<td>Bilingual Cert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half Content</td>
<td>Half Content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ex: SLA, ELA</td>
<td>Math, Science, SS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Pros**
- mirrors other grade level partnerships
- allows teachers to specialize in content

#### Paired Teaching
**50/50 DLI Language Allocation Model Only**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher A</th>
<th>Teacher B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual Cert</td>
<td>ESL Cert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish Content</td>
<td>English Content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ex: SLA, Math, Int</td>
<td>ELA, SS, Science</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Pros**
- staffing (inclusion of ESL teacher)
- clear implementation of language allocation plan

**Challenges**
- staffing ("just right" ESL teacher)
- communication – unique teacher collaboration required
- workload - dividing content by language may create heavier lift for one teacher
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Model Type</th>
<th>Goal</th>
<th>Instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transitional bilingual / early exit</td>
<td>• Primary language used as a resource</td>
<td>• Teacher(s) certified in grade level/content area and in bilingual education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Full proficiency in English is acquired to participate equitably in school</td>
<td>• Primary language instruction in literacy and academic content decreases as English is acquired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitional bilingual / late exit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual language immersion / one-way</td>
<td>• Full proficiency (grade-level literacy) attained in partner language and English</td>
<td>• Teacher(s) certified in grade level/content area and in bilingual education (or paired with an ESL certified teacher)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• At least half of literacy and academic content instruction delivered in the partner language for the duration of the program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual language immersion / two-way</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Research and Data
Program Model Comparison: National Longitudinal Research

Reading levels of English second language learners in English

- Two-Way Dual Language including Content ESL
- One-Way Dual Language including Content ESL
- Transitional BE including ESL in academic content
- Transitional BE including traditional ESL
- ESL taught through academic content (no L1)
- ESL Pullout – traditional ESL (no L1)

Average performance of native-English speakers

(Thomas & Collier, 2002)
Statewide STAAR Performance by Group (Approaches Grade Level or Above)

- Early Exit: 69%
- Late Exit: 69%
- DL One Way: 73%
- DL Two Way: 71%
- ESL Content: 57%
- ESL Pull Out: 50%

77% Statewide (All Students)
71% Bilingual Statewide
53% ESL Statewide

(TAPR 2018)
What does this mean for my district?

- There are still 4 state approved program models.
  - Early exit transitional
  - Late exit transitional
  - One-way dual language
  - Two-way dual language

- How does my district measure the effectiveness of our program model?
Challenge: Program Fidelity

Challenge:

Fidelity of implementation of effective program models

Solution:

- TAC 89 Rule Revisions
- PEIMS Revisions
- Literature Reviews
- Pilot Projects (DLI and SI in ESL)
- Implementation Rubrics
- Tools/Resources
## Program Implementation Rubric Design Features

- **Quantifiable Scoring**
- **Spectrum Integration of Models**
- **Simplified Below Compliance Description**
- **Focus on Stronger Implementation**
- **Research References**
- **Succinct Category Components**

### Program Model Design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Components</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Components</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0 Below Basic Implementation Standard</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1 Basic Implementation</strong></td>
<td>All ESL teachers of identified English learners are ESL certified. (Meets minimum requirements for ESL Pull-Out 89.321 [h]-1, 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2 Enhanced Implementation</strong></td>
<td>All content-area teachers (ELA, math, science, and social studies) of identified English learners are ESL certified. (Meets minimum requirements for ESL Content-Based 89.321 [h]-10) (Coller &amp; Thomas, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3 Exemplary Implementation</strong></td>
<td>All teachers of English learners are ESL certified, including elective course teachers, and school or district leaders provide extensive resources and training on ESL certification competencies. School districts may even provide reimbursement to teachers for ESL certification testing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Instructional Approach

- **Program Language Goals**
- **Program Content Goals**
- **Instructional Design**
- **Differentiated Support**

### Overall

- **Succinct Category Components**

---
Transitional Bilingual Implementation Rubric Outline

Program Model Design
- Teacher Certification
- Language Transition Plan
- Program Duration
- Program Literacy Goals
- Program Content Goals

Staffing and Professional Development
- Recruitment
- Assignment
- Retention
- General Education Coordination
- Special Program Coordination
- Professional Development Plan

Instructional Design: Lesson Planning and Curriculum
- Curriculum Standards
- Lesson Objectives
- Language Usage
- Differentiated Instruction & Data Analysis
- Classroom Assessments
- State Assessments & Progress Monitoring

Instructional Design: Methods and Resources
- Culturally Responsive Teaching
- Content-Based Instruction
- Resources
- Sheltered Methods:
  - Communicated
  - Sequenced
  - Scaffolded

Family and Community Engagement
- Communication
- Culture and Climate
- Parent Engagement Activities
- Family Engagement Activities
- Community Engagement Activities
## DLI Program Model Implementation Rubric Outline

### Program Model Design
- Teacher Certification
- **Language Allocation Plan**
- Program Duration
- Program Language and Literacy Goals
- Program Culture Goals

### Staffing and Professional Development
- Recruitment
- Assignment
- Retention
- General Education Coordination
- Special Program Coordination
- Professional Development Plan

### Instructional Design: Lesson Planning and Curriculum
- Curriculum Standards
- Lesson Objectives
- Language Usage
- Differentiated Instruction & Data Analysis
- Classroom Assessments
- State Assessments & Progress Monitoring

### Instructional Design: Methods and Resources
- Culturally Responsive Teaching
- Content-Based Instruction
- **Authentic Biliteracy Instruction**
- Resources
- Sheltered Methods:
  - Communicated
  - Sequenced
  - Scaffolded

### Family and Community Engagement
- Communication
- Culture and Climate
- Parent Engagement Activities
- Family Engagement Activities
- Community Engagement Activities
Next Steps for My District

- Identify program model currently in use
- Ensure that PEIMS coding is capturing Ever LEP/EL students beginning 2019-2020
- Use implementation rubrics for internal evaluation, set high leverage goals
- Identify district vision for the future of your bilingual program
- Access training through ESCs as we build capacity
Objectives

- Highlight differences in the four state-approved program models for bilingual education

- Explore research comparing the program models and statewide snapshot student outcomes

- Identify state-developed resources and tools to guide internal program evaluation and ensure fidelity of implementation
Questions?
English Learner Support welcomes your feedback!

Provide TEA EL Support your feedback with this survey:

https://goo.gl/B9z4kk

Amy Johnson
Bilingual Program Coordinator
amy.johnson@tea.texas.gov

Main phone: 512-463-9414
E-MAIL:
EnglishLearnerSupport@tea.texas.gov